

**Faculty Board on Athletics
Meeting of May 11, 2017
12:00pm – 1:30pm, 500 Main Building**

Members present: Patricia Bellia (Chair), Ann Firth, John Gaski, Brian Coughlin on behalf of Erin Hoffmann Harding, Patrick Holmes, Dan Kelly, Sean Kelsey, Mary Ann McDowell, Susan Ohmer, Jaime Pensado, Michael Stanistic, Kevin Vaughan

Members excused: Alexa Baltes, James Brockmole, Jack Swarbrick

Athletics Liaisons: Missy Conboy, Beth Hunter, Heidi Uebehler on behalf of Jill Bodensteiner

Guests: Claire Leatherwood Slebonick (recorder), Ryan Willerton (Director of Community Standards), Jim Kubinski (Head Men's Golf Coach), Susan Holt (Head Women's Golf Coach), Kathy Speybroeck (Sport Administrator for Women's Golf)

1. Call to Order and Opening Prayer

Professor Bellia called the meeting to order at 12:02 p.m. and asked Professor John Gaski to give the opening prayer.

2. Minutes of Meeting of February 24, 2017

The Faculty Board on Athletics (Board) unanimously approved the minutes of the March 24, 2017, meeting.

3. Chair's Announcements

Professor Patricia Bellia announced her approval of the men's and women's swimming and diving captains. Additionally, she recorded two votes the Board conducted via email, specifically: a recommendation to the Mendoza College of Business, subsequently approved by the dean's office, to reschedule a student-athlete's final exams to permit the student to participate on a U.S. national team; and approval of a student-athlete's request to live over the summer in an apartment her family had already rented for her sister for the academic year. In the case of the housing request, Professor Bellia noted that the Board granted the request even though the student-athlete would receive a full grant-in-aid over the summer. Some members had observed during the voting process that the student-athlete and her family were likely unaware at the time they made housing arrangements that she would receive a full grant-in-aid over the summer.

4. Class Miss Requests

a. Men's Golf (Jim Kubinski, Head Men's Golf Coach)

Professor Bellia invited Jim Kubinski, Head Men's Golf Coach, to present to the Board on the men's golf schedule and his request for additional class misses. Mr. Kubinski thanked the Board for the opportunity to present. Mr. Kubinski began by sharing that strength of schedule is a key component of the men's golf team's ranking.

Mr. Kubinski described an opportunity that had arisen for the team to participate in a new tournament with high-level teams. He stated that participating in this tournament would positively affect the team's ranking and provide an important, memorable experience. Participating in this tournament, however, would require the men's golf team to miss five Monday-Wednesday-Friday (MWF) classes and four Tuesday-Thursday (TTh) classes, rather than the four MWF and three TTh class misses that he initially proposed. Mr. Kubinski noted that because he is already under contract for the tournaments currently on the schedule, he cannot easily remove one of those matches from the schedule in order to accommodate the additional class misses necessary for participation in this new tournament.

In response to a question from Professor Dan Kelly, Mr. Kubinski replied that while this would be a tournament the men's golf team would hope to play in future years because of the quality of the teams, the schedule would be adjusted to ensure that the team's participation did not require the same number of excused absences. Professor Susan Ohmer stated that she understands why Mr. Kubinski wants his student-athletes to participate in this tournament and appreciates the impact on the schedule, but asked Mr. Kubinski to discuss how the student-athletes handle this many days of missed class. Mr. Kubinski agreed with Professor Ohmer's concern and stated that how student-athletes handle missing class is something he always considers. He noted that he rotates which five student-athletes travel and has not traveled student-athletes if they are struggling in the classroom. Mr. Kubinski believed that only two student-athletes, rather than the full team, would miss classes on all of the proposed dates and noted the excellent academic outcomes achieved by one of the two student-athletes in question.

In response to a question from Professor Michael Stanisic about the academic outcomes for the other student-athlete expected to miss all requested class misses, Mr. Kubinski said that he is confident the student-athlete will be okay as he currently has a GPA above 3.0 even with a number of challenges. Professor Stanisic, expounding on Professor Ohmer's point, noted that a student-athlete traveling for all events would miss more than twenty-five percent of TTh classes; consequently, any affected student-athlete should be very strong in the classroom. Mr. Kubinski agreed.

In response to a question from Professor Gaski, Mr. Kubinski stated that the name for the event in question is "Battle of the Bighorn" at Bighorn Golf Club. Professor Gaski asked Mr. Kubinski to comment on the academic record of the men's golf team. Mr. Kubinski replied that the men's golf team reached the number one overall team spot at Notre Dame two or three seasons ago and was the best men's team last year. Mr. Kubinski shared that he is most proud of the spring a few years ago in which the men's golf team not only reached the NCAA

Championships but did so while posting a 3.6 GPA. In response to a follow-up question from Professor Gaski, Mr. Kubinski stated that there were probably four class misses in the seasons he had just described.

Professor Bellia noted that Mr. Patrick Holmes would present some academic performance information on the men's golf team once he arrived. With no further questions, Professor Bellia thanked and excused Mr. Kubinski.

b. Women's Golf (Susan Holt, Head Women's Golf Coach, and Kathy Speybroeck, Women's Golf Sport Administrator)

Professor Bellia introduced Susan Holt, Head Women's Golf Coach, and Kathy Speybroeck, Sport Administrator for Women's Golf.

Ms. Holt thanked the Board for the opportunity and their time. She began by describing her attendance at a Board meeting several years ago with the goal of familiarizing the Board with the challenges she faces when building the women's golf team's competition schedule. Ms. Holt stated that her goal each year is to not have to come back to the Board to request additional class misses, but noted that changed circumstances for the upcoming season led to this request.

Ms. Holt described how the strength of schedule is an important component to the national ranking. Over the last seven years, to enhance the team's ranking, she had included an event in the women's golf team's schedule that rated as one of the top five collegiate events in the country. Traditionally, Ms. Holt stated, the event has taken place over Notre Dame's fall break, negating any class miss issues. The tournament site had a conflict with the host club's membership, however, resulting in a change of date for the event. By the time this change occurred, Ms. Holt had already finalized the women's golf team's schedule. She attempted to identify another tournament over Notre Dame's fall break in which the women's golf team could play, but could not. Consequently, Ms. Holt is requesting additional class misses so that the women's golf program can participate in this event on a different date, while noting that she is not pleased with needing to miss additional class time. Despite her displeasure, Ms. Holt observed that because her student-athletes traditionally turn in strong academic performances, she is less concerned about the impact on their academic performance. She also noted that four of the seven women's golfers do not have class on Friday.

In response to a question from Professor Ohmer, Ms. Holt stated that the women's golf team would miss 5.5 MWF and three TTh classes. She noted that minimizing class misses is tough given that golf tournaments are three days long, plus a practice round the day before the tournament begins. Ms. Holt said that she tries to avoid the two-day tournaments because of the added stress on the student-athletes of playing fifty-four holes of golf in forty-eight hours. She nevertheless added one of these events this year in an effort to minimize class misses. She also noted that she did not schedule the full number of contests permissible under NCAA rules. Ms. Holt added that the women's golf team is missing two Monday class days and three Friday class days, in addition to a portion of Wednesday, for a total of 5.5 MWF misses.

Professor Bellia observed that the half-day class miss begins at 2:00 p.m., and that this departure time usually has a low impact on class miss. Professor Ohmer noted the lesser impact of these class misses if four of the seven student-athletes do not have class on Fridays. Ms. Holt stated that she had yet to book plane tickets, so it is possible that there is even less impact on class time than what she is requesting.

With no further questions, Ms. Holt and Ms. Speybroeck thanked the Board. Professor Bellia thanked and excused them both.

c. Discussion

Upon Mr. Holmes joining the meeting, Professor Bellia asked for his input on both golf programs' requests for additional class misses. Mr. Holmes shared that there is a very strong culture on both teams, noting that the men's program had four MWF and four Tu/Th class misses last fall but managed to do well, achieving an average GPA for returning student-athletes of 3.41 with seven of eight student-athletes in Mendoza. Regarding the women's program, Mr. Holmes said the same is true of their culture. The student-athletes communicate well with professors and coaches are supportive. Mr. Holmes stated that it likely will be more difficult for first-year student-athletes missing that many classes than it will be for upperclass students.

Professor Sean Kelsey moved that both program's requests for additional class misses be approved, with Professor Ohmer seconding. Ten board members voted in favor of the granting the class misses with one abstention.

5. Subcommittee Report: Academic Integrity (Dan Kelly)

Professor Bellia invited Professor Kelly, chair of the Academic Integrity Subcommittee, to provide his report.

Professor Kelly reported that fourteen student-athletes submitted fifth-year applications and the subcommittee voted to approve all of them as routine. Professor Kelly emphasized that the subcommittee did a thorough review of the applications, describing the subcommittee's process and its contact with campus partners, such as the Office of Student Affairs and Academic Services for Student-Athletes. Professor Kelly alerted the Board to the fact that there may be two or three additional student-athletes submitting fifth year applications in the coming weeks.

In response to a question from Professor Bellia, Professor Kelly stated that the subcommittee may require more specificity in the rationale for chosen courses, particularly for unclassified graduate students. Professor Kelly further explained that it is important that the subcommittee understand how course work identified as part of the unclassified graduate program supports the student-athlete's future goals.

Professor Bellia confirmed that the subcommittee will communicate this desire for more specificity in the rationale for the academic program to Academic Services for Student-Athletes (ASSA). Professor Bellia also offered that the number of fifth-year applications may decrease

with a NCAA rule change that allows student-athletes to remain eligible while pursuing coursework toward a minor.

Professor Kelly reported on the four excellent student-athletes chosen to receive the Kanaley Award: Lee Kiefer, Kayleigh Olmstead, Sergio Perkovic and Monica Robinson. Professor Kelly offered descriptions of each of the four winner's impressive accomplishments.

Finally, Professor Kelly reported on the subcommittee's class clustering project, describing meetings he, Professor Bellia, and Claire Leatherwood Slebonick had with members of the Office of Strategic Planning and Institutional Research (OSPIR). Professor Kelly reported on OSPIR's work to develop a great statistical tool for the Board to use to track clustering and investigate possible concerns. Professor Kelly shared the timeline for the tool's use, noting the subcommittee will spend the following summer and academic year learning how to use the tool and exploring attendant policy recommendations.

Professor Bellia reiterated Professor Kelly's comments about the strength of the tool and entering a testing phase in the fall. Professor Bellia thanked Professor Kelly for his report.

6. Student-Athlete Disciplinary Report (Brian Coughlin and Ryan Willerton)

Professor Bellia introduced Brian Coughlin, Associate Vice President of Student Affairs, and Ryan Willerton, Director of the Office of Community Standards, to provide the 2015-16 Student-Athlete Disciplinary Report. Professor Bellia noted that she and Mr. Coughlin had a conversation in which she asked Mr. Coughlin to shift this annual report to the fall semester, to which Mr. Coughlin agreed.

Mr. Coughlin stated that he is representing Erin Hoffman Harding as well as presenting this report with Mr. Willerton, and invited Mr. Willerton to begin.

Mr. Willerton stated that the report is in the same format as it has been for the last two-three years, which makes those years the only true comparison. Mr. Willerton pointed out the changes he made in the report to reflect the Board's request for additional demographics. He noted that the numbers are fairly consistent with a small downward trend in the number of incident reports received.

In response to a question from Professor Bellia, Mr. Coughlin replied that he did not have a good sense of what caused the downward trend in incidents, but cautioned against extrapolating from the three years of data, particularly because fluctuations can occur year-to-year. In response to Professor Ohmer asking about some examples in the data, Mr. Coughlin reiterated that no conclusions can be drawn about causation at this point.

Ms. Ann Firth asked the presenters to share any insights comparing the relative severity of student-athlete cases to general student body cases. In response, Mr. Coughlin directed the Board's attention to the last page of the attachment, which described the three types of settings used to meet with students and the three outcomes considered to be the most severe. Mr. Coughlin proceeded to describe the three settings—rector meetings, conferences, and hearings—

and the situations that generally lead to their use. Mr. Coughlin noted that the student-athlete numbers included in the report are fairly reflective of the general student body numbers.

In response to a question from Ms. Beth Hunter, Mr. Coughlin replied that the disciplinary process and options changed to the current state in 2013-14 and noted the reduction in recidivism rate since that time.

Mr. Coughlin observed that the numbers as broken down by team are fairly consistent with those from years past. In response to questions from Professors Gaski and Bellia, Mr. Coughlin noted that the data reflects the number of incidents rather than the number of distinct student-athletes.

Both presenters stated that alcohol is the number one issue for both student-athletes and other students. In response to a question from Professor Kelly, Mr. Coughlin replied that most incidents for first year students are alcohol issues. Replying to a follow-up question from Professor Kelly, Mr. Coughlin confirmed that first years are often introduced to situations through upperclass students, adding that this phenomenon occurs in all student groups on campus.

Mr. Coughlin, in reply to Ms. Hunter's question, explained that his office does peer institution comparisons. These comparisons can be difficult in light of different institutional philosophies. Following up on her earlier question, Ms. Hunter asked if Mr. Coughlin and his staff had conducted a peer institution comparison of the alcohol-related data. Mr. Willerton responded that they are looking at the alcohol culture, but he emphasized the difficulty of identifying appropriate comparisons.

In response to a questions from Ms. Missy Conboy, Mr. Coughlin replied that while upperclass students can negatively affect younger student-athletes, the positive influence of older student-athletes on younger student-athletes is apparent immediately. Mr. Coughlin suggested that one approach to reducing alcohol incidents would be to eliminate the off-campus "houses" in which student-athletes from certain teams reside.

Professor Bellia noted that, at a previous meeting, the Board had had an extensive discussion of circumstances in which the Office of Community Standards requires a student to move off-campus as a disciplinary sanction. She stated that the sanction of removing someone from the residence hall sends a mixed message regarding Notre Dame's goal of achieving student-athlete integration. Mr. Coughlin responded by saying that the campus housing system is taken very seriously here. Mr. Coughlin proceeded to explain circumstances in which the disciplinary process revokes a student's opportunity to live in the residence halls, noting that the goal is to balance the need of the individual with the needs of the community in which the student lives.

In response to a question from Professor Bellia about whether or not the possession of illicit drugs off-campus could lead to the removal from residence halls, Mr. Coughlin replied that it could lead to that sanction. The Office of Community Standards would analyze the whole case, including whether a room search was necessary, whether the student stored drugs in his or her

room, and what effect the student's behavior had on the people around him or her. Mr. Coughlin noted that there have been situations in which students have been found responsible for illicit drug use off campus but have been allowed to remain in the residence halls. He noted that under the disciplinary system in place since 2013-14, there has been an inconsistency of outcomes rather than an inconsistency of process, which occurred prior to the disciplinary system changes. Mr. Coughlin explained that the disciplinary system attempts to have the greatest impact on each individual student, which means sometimes students get different outcomes for similar behaviors.

In response to a question from Professor Stanistic, Mr. Coughlin offered to work on normalizing the percentages across different roster sizes.

With no other questions, Professor Bellia thanked Mr. Coughlin and Mr. Willerton for their report.

7. Academic Reports (Pat Holmes)

Professor Bellia invited Mr. Holmes to present various academic reports to the Board.

Mr. Holmes began with a summary of the APR, released last week, pointing out the definition of APR and the metrics the NCAA uses to track graduation rates, eligibility, and retention rates. Mr. Holmes explained that APR tracks grant-in-aid (GIA) student-athletes by semester and noted that the data in this report is from the 2015-16 academic year. Describing the numbers as being consistently strong, Mr. Holmes commented that this was another solid year. Mr. Holmes noted that Notre Dame's good academic standing requirement, which determines whether a student-athlete receives an APR eligibility point, is more stringent than what the NCAA and most peer institutions require. Mr. Holmes explained that this fact led him to add adjusted numbers to the reports, which show what Notre Dame's APR would be under NCAA minima rather than Notre Dame's own requirements.

Mr. Holmes commented that Notre Dame had twelve teams with perfect scores, second to Stanford University's (Stanford) fourteen, and said that Notre Dame has either been first or second in this category since the NCAA put this metric in place eleven years ago. Mr. Holmes offered a fuller comparison of the two universities' APR rates, describing differences between the number of sports offered and the metrics used for certifying eligibility, answering several questions from the Board.

Members of the Board discussed Notre Dame's eligibility metric, its effect on the APR, and Notre Dame's standings in the APR rankings. Members expressed concern that Notre Dame's eligibility metric disadvantaged Notre Dame in relation to peer institutions.

Mr. Holmes directed the Board's attention to the second report and provided some context. He pointed out that term GPA numbers for both GIA and non-GIA student-athletes are the highest they have ever been. Mr. Holmes referenced a recommendation, arising from an Administrative Unit Review (AUR) of his office, that his office hire a learning specialist. Further research demonstrated a need for two learning specialists. Consequently, Mr. Holmes hired two

learning specialists to focus on approximately thirty of the highest risk student-athletes. Mr. Holmes reported that the improvements in this group have been dramatic, as evidenced by the comparatively higher semester GPA for those who engaged with the learning specialists and those who did not.

Mr. Holmes called the Board's attention to data comparing student-athletes to the general student body.

Mr. Holmes turned to a third report, describing it as a summary of the student-athlete population broken down in a number of ways. Mr. Holmes included test scores and cumulative GPA comparisons among the different segments, noting that the data is reduced to a level to provide more information on major choices and any areas of potential concern. Professor Ohmer thanked Mr. Holmes for this information, sharing that she and her colleagues in Film, Television, and Theatre (FTT) met to discuss the increase of student-athletes majoring in FTT.

Professor Bellia thanked Mr. Holmes for his reports and apologized for not having more time to discuss them, but encouraged members with questions to contact Mr. Holmes.

8. Other Business

Prior to adjourning, Professor Bellia recognized a term-limited member, Professor Gaski, thanking him for his six years of service. Professor Gaski said that it was a privilege to try to be of service and thanked the Board for the opportunity.

Finally, the Board voted to provide Professor Bellia with a delegation to handle issues as they arose over the summer.

9. Adjournment

Professor Bellia adjourned the meeting at approximately 1:33 p.m.